

Name _____ Date _____ Period _____

Xtra Credit: Limit Error

(from Dave L. Renfro)

Consider the following limit computations:

$$\begin{aligned}
 \lim_{x \rightarrow -\infty} \left(x + \sqrt{x^2 + 2x} \right) &= \lim_{x \rightarrow -\infty} \left[\frac{\left(x + \sqrt{x^2 + 2x} \right) \left(x - \sqrt{x^2 + 2x} \right)}{1 \left(x - \sqrt{x^2 + 2x} \right)} \right] \\
 &= \lim_{x \rightarrow -\infty} \left[\frac{-2x}{x - \sqrt{x^2 + 2x}} \right] \\
 &= \lim_{x \rightarrow -\infty} \left[\frac{-2x}{\left(x - \sqrt{x^2 + 2x} \right)} \cdot \frac{x^{-1}}{x^{-1}} \right] \\
 &= \lim_{x \rightarrow -\infty} \left[\frac{-2}{1 - \sqrt{\left(x^{-2} \right) \left(x^2 + 2x \right)}} \right] \\
 &= \lim_{x \rightarrow -\infty} \left[\frac{-2}{1 - \sqrt{1 + \frac{2}{x}}} \right]
 \end{aligned}$$

As $x \rightarrow -\infty$, we can see that $\sqrt{1 + \frac{2}{x}} \rightarrow 1^-$ (approaches 1 from below 1, since $1 + \frac{2}{x}$ will be 1 plus a negative number that's almost equal to zero). Therefore, $\left(1 - \sqrt{1 + \frac{2}{x}} \right) \rightarrow 0^+$ (approaches zero from above, since 1 minus a number smaller than one but really close to one will be positive but almost equal to zero). So, when x is a large negative number (approaching $-\infty$), $\left(1 - \sqrt{1 + \frac{2}{x}} \right)$ will be a positive number that's almost equal to zero. That means, then, that the last line shown above involves -2 divided by positive numbers approaching zero, and so this last limit is $\frac{-2}{0^+} = -\infty$. However, the ACTUAL value of

$\lim_{x \rightarrow -\infty} \left(x + \sqrt{x^2 + 2x} \right)$ is -1 , and you can prove it to yourself by evaluating $x + \sqrt{x^2 + 2x}$ on your calculator for large negative numbers. Bear in mind, though, that no amount of numerical verification mathematically PROVES that the limit is -1 . Direct substitution gives the indeterminate form $\infty - \infty$.

Directions: On this sheet, answer the following questions. Each part is worth 5 points added to a test score. The two parts may be answered independently, but no partial credit will be given on each part.

(a) (+5) Find at least one mathematical error in the above calculations that invalidates the result (be very specific) and then...

(b) (+5) Re-do the algebraic calculation correctly (or find an alternative algebraic method that is mathematically valid) to come up with the correct limit of -1 (be very detailed in your steps).